



*City of Naples*

City Council Chambers  
735 Eighth Street South  
Naples, Florida 33940

-SUBJECT-

Page

PRESENTATION BY THE CONSERVANCY, INC., WITH REFERENCE TO THE PROPOSED SABAL BAY  
MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT.

1-5

CCL176

City Council Chambers  
735 Eighth Street South  
Naples, Florida 33940



CITY COUNCIL MINUTES  
Workshop Minutes

Time 9:00 a.m.

Date 06/14/89

Mayor Putzell called the meeting to order and acted as Chairman.

Present: Edwin J. Putzell, Jr.,  
Mayor

Kim Anderson-McDonald  
William E. Barnett  
Alden R. Crawford, Jr.  
John T. Graver  
Paul W. Muenzer  
Lyle S. Richardson,  
Councilmen

Also Present:

Franklin C. Jones, City Manager  
David W. Rynders, City Attorney  
Ann "Missy" McKim, Community Dev. Dir.  
Jon C. Staiger, Ph.D., Natural Res. Mgr.  
George Henderson, Sergeant-At-Arms  
Jodie M. O'Driscoll, Deputy Clerk

See Supplemental Attendance List - Attachment #1.

\*\*\*

**\* \* \***

**\*\*\***

## ITEM 1

PRESENTATION BY THE CONSERVANCY, INC.,  
WITH REFERENCE TO THE PROPOSED SABAL BAY  
MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT.

Mayor Putzell advised this workshop session was at the request of the president of the Conservancy to provide its technical and scientific evidence relative to the proposed Sabal Bay Management Development. He asked that presentations not be repetitious and comments be minimized. The entire presentation has been limited to approximately two hours.

Attorney Joe Fleming, 620 Ingraham Building, representing the Conservancy, noted that he would introduce each expert prior to his presentation.

Dr. Robert J. Livingston, research scientist, spoke at great length regarding the effect wind had upon movement of polluted water. Many

COUNCIL  
MEMBERS

M O T I O N	S E C O N D	VOTE		A B S E N T
		Y E S	N O	

pollutants take the form of sediments and essentially fall to the waterway floor. However, should a strong wind current become prevalent, those sediments could be carried off into the system and deposited elsewhere. The pollutants in a water system adversely affect the water quality by reducing the amount of oxygen found in the water. Dr. Livingston said he believed marinas to be a perpetual source of pollution as they create more boat traffic which then produce pollution from oils, additives, dead fish, bacteria, and the like.

Referring to a slide of the Gulf of Mexico, Dr. Livingston said that if this project were planned offshore in the Gulf, there would be adequate circulation and depth which would not promote pollution. He then noted a particular project of which he currently is involved, Apalachicola Bay, wherein the wind has promoted pollution in almost pristine areas. This water system has an existing marina, and upon random sampling, it was found the pollution from that marina had infiltrated the entire ecosystem. The pollutants had formed sediment particles and those particles were moved throughout the Bay from the unpredictable change in wind current.

Dr. Livingston then spoke to the matter of dredging the channel in order to bring a greater productivity to those mangroves which were not operating efficiently. He said that while this may be true, the system currently is operating in a natural state with inshore water benefiting from nutrients in that natural phase. It is illogical to think that one can improve upon nature, he said. The proposed property for this marina, Dr. Livingston noted, is the most environmentally sensitive area to be used for such a facility. It could definitely have adverse effects upon the entire ecosystem, including the pristine Rookery Bay estuary.

In response to Councilman Barnett, Dr. Livingston said he did not have a recommendation as to where a marina would be satisfactory; however, he could reiterate that placement of this marina in that



CITY OF NAPLES, FLORIDA

City Council Minutes

Date 06/14/89

COUNCIL  
MEMBERS

M  
O  
T  
I  
O  
N

S  
E  
C  
O  
N  
D

VOTE

Y  
E  
S

N  
O

A  
B  
S  
E  
N  
T

environmentally sensitive area would adversely effect the ecosystem and cause untold quantities of pollution.

Mr. Muenzer asked if dry dock housing for the boats would cause less pollution. Dr. Livingston advised that it would, however, those boats eventually must be placed in the water, he said. Such activity would cause less pollution, but total prohibition of these facilities would eliminate the possibility of future pollution.

Dr. Samuel Snedaker, professor of marine science, Rosenstiel School in Miami, Florida, spoke regarding the effects of this project upon the mangrove environment. Dr. Snedaker reviewed the different types of mangrove forests and elevations at which these areas were flushed by the tide. He then referred to different type species of mangroves, and he noted that he had been a member of a team which studied the amount of leaf litter those species provided to the environment. His group found that the shorter species of trees, those indicated as stunted by the petitioner, actually are more efficient in their leaf production than the taller specimens. Dr. Snedaker contended that these short forests were indeed producing and that the proposed channel would not increase their productivity.

In response to Councilman Barnett, Dr. Snedaker addressed the issue of mitigation and recreation. While it is true that the petitioner intends to replace each mangrove destroyed with a new planted one, the species to be planted are singular and would provide only one type of leaf production. The existing natural forest provides a variety of species and diversity in leaf production. He said he did not believe that type mitigation the best approach in preserving Rookery Bay.

Discussion then ensued relative to biomass tonnage of the different species of mangroves. Mr. Muenzer referred to the relationship of leaf production between the tall and short trees. Dr. Snedaker advised that his group was not looking at actual amounts produced, but was determining

COUNCIL  
MEMBERS

M O T I O N	S E C O N D	VOTE		A B S E N T
		Y E S	N O	

efficiency. By that determination, his group found that the shorter species of mangroves produced leaf litter more efficiently than the taller specimens.

Dr. Ned Smith, meteorologist, spoke about tidal transport systems relative to this project. He advised that the water transport throughout a system involves not only the ebb and flow tides, but also the wind current. Dr. Smith said that it would not be unlikely to find a north/south wind current driving pollutants from the marina into the Rookery Bay system. In response to Councilman Crawford, Dr. Smith said the wind current could move sediment particles inasmuch as the wind creates wave oscillation.

Dr. Harold Wanless, topography and vegetation expert, spoke briefly regarding elevation of the proposed area for development and said that he believed this project not appropriate for the area, taking into consideration spring tides, sea level rise, and probable hurricane like conditions. Dr. Wanless concluded by saying he believed the flushing action of the proposed channel would push pollutants into the Rookery Bay system which would reduce the oxygen amount and adversely affect the marine life in that estuary.

In response to Councilman Graver, Dr. Wanless said he believed if the mature mangrove forests are disposed of along the edge of the channel, the entire ecosystem would be thrown out of stability and there could, in fact, be a significant loss of productivity during the time of change.

Dr. Bernard Yokel of the Florida Audubon Society spoke at great length reviewing the Rookery Bay estuary system. He said the proposed marina would have an adverse effect upon the environment, especially upon those sensitive nursery areas found in Rookery Bay. Organic sediments located on the bottom of the Bay floor are a major source of food for the young marine life, he said. If that food source has been contaminated with polluted sediments, then the young fish stand a good chance of dying.

-5-



SUPPLEMENTAL ATTENDANCE LIST

Robert J. Livingston  
Ned Smith  
Patty Beal  
John Aurell  
Jim Carter  
Charles Andrews  
George Williams  
Cliff Barksdale  
Barb Kolflat  
John Greco  
Stephen Erek  
Emilia F. Ewing  
Charles Cannon

Joe Fleming  
Robert H. Gore  
Dr. Durbin Tabb  
George Hermanson  
Mike Stephen  
Karyn Smith  
Harold Wanless  
Rich Henderlong  
Mari Anne Vaughn  
Harvey Raasch  
Tyler Janney  
Kate Dell  
Bob Krasowski

Samuel Snedaker  
Mark Benedict  
Bernard Yokel  
Fran Stallings  
Egon Hill  
Arthur Smith  
Keith Predmore  
Pam MacKie  
Chuck Reinbolt  
Alfred French  
Thomas Brown  
Mrs. Falconer Jones  
Irving Berzon

Other interested citizens and visitors.

NEWS MEDIA

Lori Darvas, Naples Daily News

CC1176